UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK

ARMANDO RUBEN FAZZOLARI and JULIO ROBERTO PEREZ,

Plaintiffs,

REPUBLIC OF ARGENTINA.

Defendant.

05 CV 9072 (TPG)

(PROPUSED) AMENDED ORDER AND OPINION

USDC SDNY DOCUMENT

ELECTRONICALLY FILEI

DOC #:

DATE FILED: 3/26/09

Plaintiff Armando Ruben Fazzolari and plaintiff Julio Roberto Perez are the beneficial owners of certain bond indebtedness issued by defendant the Republic of Argentina (the "Republic"). The Republic defaulted on such indebtedness in December 2001 during a profound fiscal crisis. Plaintiffs are suing to recover amounts due to them as a result of the default and have moved for summary judgment.

The motion is granted.

FACTS

The bond indebtedness at issue is governed by one of three agreements: (1) a Fiscal Agency Agreement dated October 19, 1994 (the "1994 FAA"), (2) a Fiscal Agency Agreement dated December 10, 1993 (the "1993 FAA"), or (3) a Floating Rate and Bond Exchange Agreement dated December 6, 1992 (the "FRB Agreement"). The 1994 FAA is the same agreement that governed the bond indebtedness on which this court granted summary judgment to the plaintiffs in Lightwater Corporation Ltd. v. Republic of Argentina, No. 02 Civ. 3804, 2003 WL 1878420 (S.D.N.Y. Apr. 14, 2003). Section 22 of the 1994 FAA, Section 20 of the 1993 FAA, and Section 6.07 of the FRB Agreement state that the Republic waives sovereign immunity and consents to jurisdiction in any state or federal court in the borough of Manhattan in the City of New York. All three agreements provide that the Republic's obligations on the

bonds are unconditional and that failure to make any payment of principal or interest for 30 days after the applicable payment date constitutes an event of default. A declaration by the Republic of a moratorium on the payment of principal or interest on its public external indebtedness is an event of default as well. Paragraph 12 of the 1994 FAA provides for acceleration of principal if there is a failure to pay interest or a moratorium. If either of these events occurs,

each holder of Securities and such Series may by such notice in writing declare the principal amount of Securities of such Series held by it to be due and payable immediately....

On December 24, 2001 the Republic declared a moratorium on payments of principal and interest on the external debt of the Republic. The court refers to its previous opinions for a description of the circumstances of these defaults. <u>Lightwater</u>, 2003 WL 1878420, at 2; <u>Applestein v. Republic of Argentina</u>, No. 02 Civ. 1773, 2003 WL 1990206, at 1 (S.D.N.Y. Apr. 29, 2003). On July 2, 2007, plaintiff Armando Ruben Fazzolari and plaintiff Julio Roberto Perez sent notices to the Fiscal Agent of the Republic of Argentina declaring the principal amounts of the debt securities governed by the 1994 FAA and 1993 FAA held by plaintiffs to be immediately due and payable.

The bonds that are the subject of this action are listed hereafter. Also listed are the amounts of the beneficial interests owned by plaintiffs.¹

The following tables contain the necessary identifying information regarding plaintiffs' beneficial interest in bonds.

¹ The court notes the distinction between bonds and beneficial interests. In some previous opinions, the court has simply referred to the plaintiffs as owners of "bonds," when in fact plaintiffs are technically owners of "beneficial interests in bonds." The Republic actually issues "a bond" to a depository. The depository, in some form, issues "participations" to brokers, who sell "beneficial interests" to purchasers. These beneficial interests are identified by reference to the underlying bond (CUSIP or ISIN number or both; date of issuance and maturity; rate of interest) and the principal amount of the beneficial interest. This distinction is discussed more fully in Million Air Corp. v. Republic of Argentina, No. 04 Civ. 1048, 2005 WL 256126 (S.D.N.Y. Oct. 17, 2005).

TABLE 1

Plaintiff Beneficial Owner:	Armando Ruben Fazzolari
Face Value:	USD \$ 122,000.00
CUSIP No., ISIN No., BB No.:	ISN US04011AR16
Date of Issuance:	January 30, 1997
Date of Maturity:	January 30, 2017
Interest Rate/Payable:	11.375 %
Date of Purchase:	August 2001
Acceleration:	July 2, 2007
Contract Documents: (FAA; FRB; Indenture; Offering Prospectus; Certificates, etc.)	FAA dated October 19, 1994
Evidence of Ownership Proffered:	Account Statement from Societé Générale
(Account Statements; Letters; Notarized Statements, etc.)	Banking & Trust ("SG") dated April 4, 2007
Date of Maturity: Interest Rate/Payable: Date of Purchase: Acceleration: Contract Documents: (FAA; FRB; Indenture; Offering Prospectus; Certificates, etc.) Evidence of Ownership Proffered:	January 30, 2017 11.375 % August 2001 July 2, 2007 FAA dated October 19, 1994 Account Statement from Societé Géné Banking & Trust ("SG") dated April 2007

TABLE 2

Plaintiff Beneficial Owner:	Julio Roberto Perez
Face Value:	USD \$ 72,000.00
CUSIP No., ISIN No., BB No.:	ISN US04011FC91
Date of Issuance:	March 15, 2000
Date of Maturity:	March 15, 2010
Interest Rate/Payable:	11.375 %
Date of Purchase:	August 4, 2000
Acceleration:	July 2, 2007
Contract Documents: (FAA; FRB; Indenture; Offering Prospectus; Certificates, etc.)	FAA dated October 19, 1994
Evidence of Ownership Proffered: (Account Statements; Letters; Notarized Statements, etc.)	Account Statements from Caja de Valores from January 1, 2005 to March 3, 2005 and from January 10, 2006 to December 31, 2006;

DISCUSSION

This Court has already granted summary judgment in other cases similar to plaintiffs' seeking action to collect on the Republic's defaulted bonds issued under the 1994 FAA, the 1993 FAA and the FRB Agreement. This has occurred in <u>Lightwater</u>, <u>supra</u>, <u>Mazzini v. Republic of Argentina</u>, No. 03 Civ. 8120, 2005 WL 743090 (S.D.N.Y. Mar. 31, 2005), <u>Meridian Investment and Business Corporation v. Republic of Argentina</u> No. 05 Civ 5187. Only certain specific issues need to be discussed in connection with the present motion.

Standing and Proof of Ownership

In the two opinions in <u>Fontana v. Republic of Argentina</u>, 415 F.3d 238 (2d Cir. 2005), and <u>Applestein v. Province of Buenos Aires</u>, 415 F.3d 242 (2d Cir. 2005), the Second Circuit has held that an owner of a beneficial interest, such as plaintiffs here, must receive authorization from the registered holder of the bond before they may sue, but that such authorization may be granted subsequent to the filing of a lawsuit. Alternatively, the Republic may waive the authorization requirement.

The Republic has agreed to waive objections based on lack of authorization where the court makes a finding of current ownership. See Transcript, March 28, 2006, Cilli v. Republic of Argentina (04 Civ. 6594).

Here, plaintiffs Fazzolari and Perez have adequately demonstrated through their account statements that they owned their respectively beneficial interest as of December 31, 2006 and April 4, 2007. There is no evidence of a change of ownership thereafter.

CONCLUSION

The motion for summary judgment is granted. Judgment will be entered for the principal amount of the bonds issued under the 1994 FAA plus accrued interest.

The parties shall consult with one another concerning the form of the judgment and the amounts of interest that should be awarded in the judgment. If the parties are able to

reach agreement, they shall jointly submit an agreed proposed judgment to the Court to be entered on a date agreed to by the parties upon consultation with Chambers. If the parties are unable to reach agreement on those subjects, plaintiffs shall submit a proposed judgment to the Court, and the Republic shall submit any objections to the proposed judgment within five business days thereafter. The Court will then resolve any remaining disagreements. Proposed judgments submitted to the Court should include the following language: "It is further ORDERED that, until further notice from the Court, plaintiffs must refrain from selling or otherwise transferring their beneficial interest in the bonds involved in this action without advising the Court in advance and obtaining permission of the Court."

SO ORDERED.

Dated: New York, New York

March 26, 2008

-October , 2007-

U.S.D.J.

W	ľΥ	MQ.		MEN.	US (88	ነር ቦታ	1.0	SE IX	700	3 TA 6	1989	200	U (A)	лe	10.1	333	ИŒП	844	50	5 N	313	વક્ષ	10	CD.	2.00	STA.	676	10.11	BU.	(Win	ፓንንክ	eκro		100	32.02	1.0	100	A		20	COL.	97.24	1000	100	0.35	17.3	13.5	de
ăi.	.24	138	883	u na	42.0	di Ki	AM)	Mili	300	WW.	EXE	230	300	æ	387	get.	iii.	33.0	188	3.00	200	100	200		Юů	$\alpha \omega$	M.	2010	MAX.	IN E	E six	430	1515	2012	n_{L0}		5.00		4	40.4	piece.	10%			1000	1	Ki.	100
22	ĊΦ	JG8	153	1015	30.50°	423	10.0	Date:	0.00	4.13	alux.	6.3	$M_{\rm b}^{\rm eff}$	20	, iv. 1	Take.	arr.	370	- 3	att	상당	-31	341	200	1300	BAX.	WSN:	ane	3510	ÆΕ	2.30	130	al lu		Name:	(\mathcal{N})		. 30		di ak	333	-31%		100	12. N. 2	G-4.7.3	200	17:00
И	7.5	N,			33.6		814	MAN	231	31.3	res:	43.	5.11	480		3.5			337	200	3.00	100	380	m_{ij}	1900)		(5.2)	14	312	773		-	Мü	NIX.	527.I	77X	Cab		0 6	alets	1	100	经货物	30 W	200.44	c_{GCC}		33.13
ш	.44	80	ļ. sh	10.0		μ?Š.	13.17	41		(a,b)	ДH	45		æ	133	1914		0.4			V. 1	120					1,385	431	333	333		100	MЖ	281	tath:	100	IJ	υп	68.3	M.C	36.76	1	1.56	34.5	0.002	2000	ΔŒ	men:
ж	te;	177	77	11,00		10.11		1.97	93.4	494	200	1.77	110	ДΝ			۲٠.		20	(5.5)	80.	91.5		C.,	.000	$\Delta \lambda$	UN.	10	323		ME.	236	3)21	100	100	ana.	100	100	1,115	20010	15.5			$\mathbf{E}^{1,1}$	1400	100	11.1	217

AND PRICE OF THE P		ň,	$\frac{6000}{937}$	01/4	A In		*G.			440						- A.	10		* 1.00	. 3								47		1
AURINEANNID (STRITTEN PARTY) AND	A			L.E.		(1)/		100 h	10	8		417	, <u>-</u> 2-	igal) Teor	Y (Y)	0.00												Sec. 14		
AURINEANNID (STRITTEN PARTY) AND		17	70	1.5	1333 H 1001		344				,,												1			J. 1	J. Ka	MA A		
AURINEANNID (STRITTEN PARTY) AND	'n	a V		ب با				1.214		c				, N.	/			F												
AURINEANNID O TRATTO PROTECT AND CAMBELLIAN DELLA TRATTO DE LA CONTRACTOR			10					Δķ	, ,)		أزيدة	U)	1 6	24		2.4.	1	\mathbb{C}^{λ}										Carr		
ARNAMIDO INTERESTANTES A MARIA M BITO NUMBER ROMANIA MARIA	**	38				4						il (4		12.77		Á.						6.0							and the
ARNAMDORESENTE ACONTRACTOR SERVICES COMPANION OF THE SERVICES COMPANIO					and a l	Charta.											Ų.				200 A V	77.39		Miles.	See Miles	7/201	(Search)			
	4	W.			ĬŲ.	3)11		់ជ្រុំ			VZ.		'n.	y.	Ċ						1			Sec. 3		i - Cas karant	ากให้ที่ โดยเล		ydillin Gullet	
						13%	, and a second	500 A (2.50)		*/i	1		7.3		, i	27														
						1000				844.					113	X.											2.4			
					8 g			347	() ()							10					5									
		iliu		774					an sin Tazin																				V PA	

Plantoppe and

æ	J ()		1	C # 500	11.5%	100	J. 18	W. Te	3160	1310	A.K.I	45.	E/N	սուկ	ስብራ	ALC:	uma	MAN.	Man!	W.A	W.	1264.5	913	w	200	-122	Mag	33 U	r NGC	144	KA YA	20	347	7,000		61850	4	A.X.	100	900	N. 1	4.7		20.00	See
٠.,	9.1	0.0	013		K. (*)	E.S	33733	25.5	are s	SHI I	W	200	3333	\mathbb{R}^{n}	1483	201	34	$\mathbf{M}_{\mathbf{S}}$	ΑN	33.5	i Wali		rr,	IJΑ	728	140	A	t to the	144	91.60	100	V65 /	57.	i ilikari				1.30	1	23622	1/2/3	303.55	300	244	1
	3.1	10.		للأعاض	3000	1.5	1383	274	N23	\mathbf{x}_{0}	320		110	18	MA.	MIN.		Υ'n.	: 3.3	Mili	88	100 P	o5)Y	13.3	310	20,6	ret.	Mail.	$x_{\rm ad}$	100	100	6.88	NAME OF	11.20		1000	2	200	3100	C513	199.0	5121	200	IMG	200
1.1	-10	3.1	216	100	W 31	TO S	A HAVE	## S	1,53	300	വ്യാ	ar:	37.5	417	RA.	XXII	837	άX,	100	兇指	100	144	380	335	瓣	118	33.Y	3493	V) &	200		236	1872	115	205	is e		8668	150	5.5	1 1	**************************************	2.4	334	100
3	7.10	YW.	18.4	141/4	å k	HOLF.	95.0	jin i		100	32.0	270	alu fi	ИX	MI.	600	300	Gel.	TO XX	#UN	W.W	默然	i i v	100	333	11.	联基	SEED.	EU:	90 S	15.67	32C	翻器	CHAIN	C2 (8)	1044		3	3774		N 258	200	4.00	4	10%
340	1.7		90 T	auris.	718	448	200	SOUTH .		3.0	4.3	315	MA		$x_{\rm IU}$	W.	KK ZI	W.O	320	16/4	33	237	300	243	, P.	en u	5170		ii Vit	Sec.	K.C.	100	100	77.15	(No.	ЮU.			2403	1	e i	100	aspul	m_{22}	
310	131	890	*XXV	All file	W¥£	rite in	10.0	82 E	100	15		157	13737	an.	ace.	.401	83 C.	CHI.	323	WĐ	200	XV)	N K A	170	J	1140	$\lambda \omega$	4.0X	ЩĦ	83420	420	27.1	240	16.6		13.0		100	110.0	200	1100	6.2	0.50	NEW Y	25
12	17.	WI)			1637		0.00	χ_{ij}		100	1.0	300	. 5	œ	$L_{i} N_{i}$		500	arg.	ilog	147	2323	70.	Mr.	3.5	230	100	300	\mathfrak{M}_{3}	1200	GD4	1524	6 W		17749	986	in Riv	W. 7	4	7.5	100	1	100	200	64.	E-37
20	amı	n = 1	- 0	34.0	5.00	202		73. <u> </u>	200					A^{SS}	- 1	900		523	ЖH	#03	223	givy)	c > 0	Sec. 3	ыз	75-3	200	動給	366	COLUC	10.0	24.5	D. C.	AL LA	17.1			100		200	535	1.	STEEL ST	4.72	0.2
υĻ	ПXI	÷Ν	23	uun.	ara a	Haar	12)	730		77	MT		o ni	510	31;		Chr.	. 14	₩6	100	320	DOM:	410	3.0	EF S	330	1866	W.S	1212	33.8	263	24.7	910	1.3		23	2.0	79 P	10	az a	77. PK	C	17	37	1
100	W.	84	맞는	1,541	945	102	11.1	ii ji l	بيدانا	100	.√iib	g: 142	5VI	η,	370	- 31	Nï	Wi:	3133	100	100	W.	010	1910	жŊ,	91	29.0	20%	all Y	ទាស្រ	65 X	20.	60 A	100	841	(i)		690	\$ 13	8		200		1.54	355
Lv.	21./	ma.	ugi.	1083		3.07		57.62		~ 2	1.15	0.30	65.		Ţ.			20	## ()	150	200	1.8	10	ĕΕ	1.4	14	13/4	aun.	7 X	Lisau	Tala:	24.	2	S. 1.	1.35	20.03	ور کول	N. 3	3.0	la il.	1.0	49.0	N. Alex	100	500
N.	14.	SM3	200	2000	MAG)	0.50	100	90.00			9, 15	3000		0.33	7.0			20	Шű	2.5		K.C	a,	. O.	13.7	(C_{i})	10.9	Call	导头	16 5	76.35	0.5	55.55	5 42		Sec.	2. 7.	100	1200		11.24	4000	izi Ki	Ç.,	9
t b	144	100	- 1	130		18.00		y		1.34	: 3".5		240	400	Yet.		r_{ij}	33123	7006	280	532		131	30%	200	VAID		W.		100	ALC:		SON B	300	Carry		92	7-7-	339	37.5		1.19	168条	y	o.
TW.	МΩ	₩Ū		1300	20.03	10.5	one i	M. J.	a > 0	$a \leq b$		7/1	60.7	200			78.0	10.0	LI G	187		903	L	42.0	Ma	书诗		110.1			4.7		. 44	14	7,77				110	3.35	100	Grand A		11	. S
133	100	132	r-m	10.14	911	313	100		an .	350	19	ш	£	35.	220	0.00	100	X 27	M2	400	ND.			100	774	1131	SAI.		0123	SMC.	23	200	wills	10 m		N. C	2000	. n.	1977	31.	10,525	Agenter.	7.0	liore:	/17
114	ways	šila i d	MH XX	51.50	25.74	44374	66K 23	がなり	March 1					3.5		W201	122,000	nux.	1877	GH3	PM-	ROSE	7527	75 M	HOUSE.	2011	72.64	30.40	KO SE	253	Marin.	344	м	5 V 3	0.338	24.14	1,500	1 6	12000	10 10 5	Maria Car	5 4 W	64.0%		1100

			A concrete to the
		0.00 V V V V V V V V V V V V V V V V V V	
Real Andrews	2		
A Company of the Comp			
		i f i	
	Metroscipallading		
网络哈拉尔德尔特尔德尔特特人名 尔克内特特尔德尔斯特尔特尔德尔特尔特尔特尔特尔特尔特尔特尔特尔特尔特尔特尔特尔特尔特尔	Witter Officer		
	主义是对自己的主义来的影響		
	Trace on an army		Mark 18 April
			Year State Control
		10 m	

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I HEREBY CERTIFY under penalty of perjury that on October 25, 2007, a copy of plaintiffs Armando Ruben Fazzolari and Julio Robert Perez' Amended Proposed Order and Opinion in support of their motion seeking Summary Judgment was served upon the following person by the United States Postal Service, postage prepaid to:

Cleary Gottlieb Steen & Hamilton
One Liberty Plaza
New York, New York 10006
Attorneys for defendant the Republic of Argentina

Dated: October 25, 2007

New York, New York

John P. Gleason (JG 2848)